

**STATE ASSESSORS BOARD MEETING**  
**Approved Minutes of April 19, 2007 Meeting**  
**Michigan Townships Association Building, Conference Room**  
**Located at 512 Westshire, Lansing, Michigan**

**CALL TO ORDER:** 9:30 a.m., April 19, 2007, in a Conference Room, Michigan Townships Association Building, located at 512 Westshire, Lansing, Michigan

**ROLL CALL:**

Members Present:

Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson  
Henry O. Allen, Vice Chairperson  
Maxine J. McClelland, Member  
Frederick W. Morgan, Member  
Raman A. Patel, Member  
Joan E. Peoples, Executive Secretary

Others Present:

Eugene Thornton  
Richard Sharland

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** Reading, Review and approval of minutes of the March 23, 2007, State Assessors Board meeting Motion by Patel, seconded by Morgan and unanimously approved.

**FINANCIAL REPORT:** 2005-2006 Fiscal Year End Financial Report dated September 30, 2006 with a balance of \$257,913.84. Motion by Patel to receive and file the report. Motion seconded by McClelland and unanimously approved.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- 1) Eugene Thornton was present to discuss reinstatement of assessor certification. Motion by McClelland to allow two options: Option #1 is to retake the exam and completion of an appraisal record card at Level 2, pay exam and recertification fees, Option #2 is to take required educational programs, pay fees and penalties due. The motion was seconded by Patel and unanimously approved.

**EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:**

- 1) Correspondence from Jack Van Coevering, Chairman, Michigan Tax Tribunal was read, motion by Morgan to receive and file with the Secretary corresponding with Chairman Van Coevering thanking him for assisting the State Assessors Board through the years in the education of assessing officers. The motion was seconded by McClelland and unanimously approved.

**EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS Cont.:**

- 2) Continuing Education Requests:
  - a. Motion by Patel, seconded by McClelland to approve a request for 6 hours of educational renewal credit for an educational program titled Institute of Professionals in Taxation at Masco Corporation, on April 27, 2007. The motion was unanimously approved.
  - b. Motion by Patel, seconded by McClelland to approve a request for 6 hours of educational renewal credit for an educational program titled Appraising REO and Foreclosure Properties Offered at Western Michigan University on May 18, 2007. The motion was unanimously approved.
  - c. Motion by Patel, seconded by McClelland to approve Jane Meddaugh, CMAE 3 for 6-hours of educational credit for attendance of the class titled Commercial Architecture Building Construction offered at the Michigan Assessors Association School in October 2006, in Gaylord. The motion was unanimously approved.
  - d. Motion by Morgan, seconded by Allen to deny approval of a request for 6-hours of educational credit for programs titled 2006 Legal Updates and ADA and Fair Housing (web programs) The programs do not pertain to assessing and therefore were not approved. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 3) The Test Committee will meet at 1:30 this afternoon to review 100 new test questions on Principles of Appraising and Computers.

**OLD BUSINESS:**

- 1) The 2008 calendars are ordered. A sample of the calendars was made available for examination. The calendars will be paid for by the State Assessors Board Members on October 1, 2007, sent by the company to the State Assessors Board on October 15, 2007.
- 2) The tentative State Assessor Board Meeting Schedule was reviewed, the May meeting date was changed from May 19 to May 18.
- 3) The Bath Township contract with Chuck Zemla was reviewed and approved. Motion by McClelland, second by Patel and unanimously approved.

**OLD BUSINESS Cont.:**

- 4) The amended Uncertified Units List was reviewed by the board.
- 5) Ronald Lupi correspondence was reviewed. The Secretary is instructed to respond to the correspondence regarding attainment of Level 3 certification and the Level 3 Comprehensive Level 3 Examination. Motion by Allen, seconded by McClelland and unanimously approved.

**NEW BUSINESS:**

- 1) Darlene Hentschel correspondence regarding reinstatement of assessor certification. Motion by McClelland to offer two options. Option #1 is to retake the exam and complete the appraisal record card at Level 2, pay exam and recertification fees, Option #2 is to take educational program, pay fees and penalties due. The motion was seconded by Patel and unanimously approved.
- 2) The process and procedure for certification levels of assessing officers and assessment units was presented to the Board. It will be reviewed again at summer conference.
- 3) China Township, St. Clair County requested a reduction in certification level based upon a Level 4 assessor valuing the power plant located in the Township. The State Assessors Board voted to approve the reduction in certification level upon receipt of a copy of the contract with a Level 4 assessing officer showing the fee paid for the service. Motion by Allen, seconded by McClelland and unanimously approved.
- 4) A request from Aranac County requesting conditional certification or having an adjoining county equalization director advise their county equalization director was reviewed. The Secretary was directed to correspond with the county regarding the matter.

**CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS:** Motion by McClelland, seconded by Allen to approve amendments to the certification list. The motion was unanimously approved.

**CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS  
APRIL 9, 2007**

**LEVEL 1**

Babbitt, Denise M.  
Booth, Lorraine  
Brassard, Lori  
Franckowiak, Diane J.

Frederick, Benjamin  
Gooch, Elizabeth A.  
Macon, Tracy L.  
Rocheleau, Marcia Ann

Russell, Amy L.  
Smith, Sabrina S.  
Tobias, Elizabeth A.  
Uhen, Stephen G.

**LEVEL 2**

Black, Margaret E.  
DeYonker, Diana M.

Gonzales, Michael J.  
Macon, Tracy L.

Wichterman, Susan K

**LEVEL 3**

Scripture, Robert

**CERTIFICATION TOTALS AS OF 4/9/07**

LEVEL 1	676
LEVEL 2	1,004
LEVEL 3	891
LEVEL 4	151
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>2,722</b>

**INFORMAL REVOCATION HEARING:**

- 1) Revocation petition 06-0030, 06-0031, 06-0032, 06- 0034, 06-0034, 06-0035

At request of the assessing officer named in revocation petition numbers 06-0030, 06-0031, 06-0032, 06- 0034, 06-0034, 06-0035 a closed meeting is to be held. Motion by Patel, seconded by Morgan to go into closed session. Roll Call Vote: Hobart-Yes, Allen-Yes, McClelland-Yes, Morgan-Yes, Patel-Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

**REVOCATIONS Cont.:**

Motion by Patel, seconded by Morgan to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Hobart-Yes, Allen-Yes, McClelland-Yes, Morgan-Yes, Patel-Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

Motion by Allen to dismiss revocation petitions 06-0030, 06-0031, 06-0032, 06-0034, 06-0035 because no violation of law or rule by the assessor was discovered in the investigation. The motion was seconded by McClelland and unanimously approved.

**CLOSED MEETING:**

According to Freedom of Information Act, Section 15.243 (1) (b) (ii) and Closed Sessions; permissible purposes 15.268 Sec. 8 (h)

Motion by Patel, seconded by Morgan to go into closed session. Roll Call Vote: Hobart-Yes, Allen-Yes, McClelland-Yes, Morgan-Yes, Patel-Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

Closed session to review:

**Closed Meeting Minutes:**

1. Closed meeting minutes for March 23, 2007

**Revocations:**

2. Revocation petition 07-0004
3. Revocation petition 07-0005
4. Revocation petition 07-0006
5. Revocation petition 07-0007

**Grading Exams:**

6. Narrative Appraisal Grading Status

Motion by Patel, seconded by Morgan to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Hobart-Yes, Allen-Yes, McClelland-Yes, Morgan-Yes, Patel-Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

#### OPEN MEETING

#### **Closed Meeting Minutes:**

- 1) Motion by McClelland to approve the closed meeting minutes for March 23, 2007. The motion was seconded by Morgan and unanimously approved.

#### **Revocations:**

- 2) Revocation petition 07-0004 was reviewed and dismissed because the State Assessors Board does not have jurisdiction over special assessment projects. Michigan Administrative Code R211.447 Rule 47 (1) reads in part, "the board shall reject any petition if it determines that the aggrieved party had or has an adequate remedy under another statute." Special assessment projects may be appealed to the local government followed by an appeal to the Michigan Tax Tribunal if necessary. Motion was by Allen, seconded by McClelland and unanimously approved.
- 3) Revocation petition 07-0005 was reviewed. Motion by Allen to ask the assessor named in the revocation petition to respond in writing. The motion was seconded by Patel and unanimously approved.
- 4) Revocation petition 07-0006 was reviewed. Motion by Morgan, seconded by McClelland to ask the assessor named in the revocation petition to respond in writing regarding holding meetings with the Board of Review in closed session. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 5) Revocation petition 07-0007 was reviewed. Motion by Allen to dismiss the revocation because no violation of law or rule pertaining to assessing was found. The motion was seconded by Morgan and unanimously approved.

#### **ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

The next meeting is scheduled for May 18, 2007.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

Motion by Patel, seconded by McClelland to adjourn the meeting at 12:00 noon. The motion was seconded by Allen and unanimously approved.

Respectfully Submitted,

---

Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson

---

Joan E. Peoples, Executive Secretary